



Annual Report 2019 - 2020

National Business Education Accreditation Council (NBEAC)



nbeac@hec.gov.pk



www.nbeac.org.pk

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAIRMAN'S MESSAGE	2
A. MANAGEMENT COUNCIL MEETINGS	3
B. NETWORKING	4
THE 7 TH DEANS & DIRECTORS CONFERENCE 2020	4
C. ACCREDITATION	10
ELIGIBILITY SCREENING COMMITTEE (ESC) MEETINGS	10
ACCREDITATION AWARD REVIEW COMMITTEE (AAC) MEETINGS	10
PEER REVIEW VISITS.....	10
PEER REVIEWER DISCUSSION FORUM 2020	11
D. TRAINING	12
ONLINE TRAINING "EFFECTIVE DISTANCE LEARNING IN COVID19 LOCKDOWN"	12
SEMINAR ON "ACCREDITATION OF BUSINESS SCHOOLS"	12
SEMINAR ON ACCREDITATION OF BUSINESS SCHOOLS.....	13
SEMINAR ON ACCREDITATION	13
WORKSHOP ON "IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF INITIATIVES AND ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN BY BUSINESS SCHOOLS"	14
WORKSHOP ON "DESIGNING AND ALIGNING PLO'S AND CLO'S"	14
WORKSHOP ON "DEVELOPING GENDER AND DIVERSITY LEADERSHIP IN HIGHER EDUCATION"	14
WORKSHOP ON "DEVELOPING AND TEACHING COURSES"	15
WORKSHOP ON "TEACHING THROUGH CASES"	16
WORKSHOP ON "FACULTY DEVELOPMENT AT BUSINESS SCHOOLS"	16
E. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE (2019-20)	18
ANNEXURE I- MEMBERS OF MANAGEMENT COUNCIL	19
ANNEXURE II- COMMITTEES	20
ANNEXURE III- NBEAC SECRETARIAT STAFF	21
ANNEXURE IV- PARTNERSHIPS FOR TRAINING	22

CHAIRMAN'S MESSAGE

The period from July 2019 through February 2020 was normal and saw the typical range of NBEAC activities (accreditation, training and networking) implemented in a conventional manner. The remainder of the year, however, was far from normal. From March through June 2020, our activities were affected by the restrictions imposed to cope with the global pandemic of Covid19. Our office routines were interrupted as staff had to work from home for several months. We also stopped face to face training and accreditation activities for several months. Fortunately, the principal networking event of the year, the annual Deans and Directors Conference, had already taken place in February 2020 and so was not affected.

While the overall impact of the Covid19 related restrictions on office work and mobility were disruptive, some positive lessons have also emerged from our experience. First, we have seen that is possible to conduct some of the bureaucratic work of the organization away from the office using digital technology. For example, we were able to conduct all committee meetings and one Council meeting this way. Second, while we had to postpone 5 training activities due in FY20, we found it was possible to conduct many such activities online. Moreover, participation turned out to be higher than in face-to-face trainings and participant feedback has been quite positive. By going online, we have also been able to recruit more international trainers to participate in our webinars.

Accreditation is one area where we are scrambling to make up for our inability to conduct physical visits in the last quarter of 2020. We had to postpone 8 accreditation visits into the next fiscal year. We have discussed the possibility of doing virtual accreditations but this seems difficult under local conditions. Much is gained by physical visits and discussions (especially with faculty and students) that cannot be replaced by virtual consultations. So we will most likely continue with physical visits, as and when possible with appropriate safeguards.

This year's Deans and Directors Conference focused on the issues of quality and inclusivity among Pakistani business schools. Discussions were framed by two important addresses, one by Dr. Abdul Hafiz Shaikh, Advisor to the PM, at the beginning of the conference and one by Dr. Tariq Banuri, Chairman of HEC, at the end of the conference. Both speakers highlighted key aspects of the challenge of enhancing quality and inclusivity in Pakistani higher education and argued passionately for a shift in mindset, culture and governance to accomplish this.

We look forward to a resumption of the full range of operational services in the new fiscal year and will take advantage of our experience with online activities to redesign some services. We also plan to integrate virtual service delivery with our strategic planning for the longer run.

With thanks to all who contributed to NBEAC's activities during the past year.

Farrukh Iqbal

A. MANAGEMENT COUNCIL MEETINGS

Three Council meetings took place during the year, the 22nd on September 16, 2019, the 23rd on February 18, 2020 and the 24th on June 23, 2020. The last-mentioned was held as a virtual meeting due to mobility restrictions brought about by the Covid19 pandemic

Among special issues considered and actions taken were the following:

- a) *Registering business school graduates?* Being of the view that there was no public safety interest in having a registration system for business students like the one prevailing for medical and engineering students, the Council decided against this proposal.
- b) *Mentorship for business schools.* The Council suggested that the mentorship process be reviewed by the Strategic Planning and Development Committee (SPDC) to see if it could be strengthened with the objective of providing more effective advice to potential accreditation applicants. As an example, it was noted that the ESC letter should not limit SAR submission to 3 months as some institutions might need more time.
- c) *New program accreditation.* Dr. Nadia Tahir suggested that, when approached by an institution to accredit a new master's level (18 year) program, NBEAC should first confirm if the program has been given a No Objection letter by the Quality Assurance Division of HEC as required for all graduate programs launched after 2013. This suggestion was accepted by the Council.
- d) *Selection of PRT members.* The Council approved the revised selection process for Peer Review Team (PRT) members. The process is outlined in a document entitled "PRT Selection Process and Criteria." A key requirement is that all PRT members (except shadow members) must have undergone prior training in NBEAC accreditation standards and procedures.
- e) *Selecting Council members.* The Chairman of HEC had suggested that an expression of interest process be incorporated into NBEAC's procedures for selecting candidates to be sent to him. The Council agreed with this idea but reiterated that candidates forwarded should also meet certain qualifying conditions such as prior service to NBEAC (via PRT work, for example).
- f) *Updated accreditation procedures.* The Council approved the revised rubric (Rubric 3.0) prepared by a committee including Dr. Farrukh Iqbal, Dr. Shaukat Brah, Dr. Sadia Nadeem, Dr. Abdul Rehman and Dr. Asfia Obaid. It also approved the revised SAR, the registration application form and the proposed digitization of the accreditation process.
- g) *Virtual accreditations?* In view of the prevailing pandemic that had made face to face interactions problematic, virtual accreditations were approved by the Council on a pilot basis. The first pilot should be a case involving reaccreditation. Learnings from two or three pilots should be shared as soon as practicable with the Council.
- h) *Accreditation fee.* The Council approved a lower accreditation fee of PKR 200,000/- per program on the understanding that travel, room and board costs for the peer review team would be shifted entirely to applicant institutions.
- i) *Compensation for trainers.* Staff noted that new compensation rates had to be devised for trainers providing online training. Members approved the suggested offer of PKR 2500/- per hour.
- j) *Remembering Prof. Nisar Siddiqui.* Dr. Farrukh Iqbal suggested that the services of the late Prof. Nisar Ahmed Siddiqui be commemorated in the upcoming Deans and Directors Conference. All members endorsed the idea.

B. NETWORKING

THE 7TH DEANS & DIRECTORS CONFERENCE 2020

This conference took place in Islamabad on the 18th and 19th of February. Prominent guests included: Dr. Abdul Hafeez Shaikh (Advisor to PM for Finance & Review; Chief Guest); Dr. Ishrat Husain (Advisor to PM for Institutional Reforms and Austerity; Guest of Honor) and Dr. Tariq Banuri (Chairman, HEC; Guest of Honor).

The following are extracts from the report on the Conference. The full report can be accessed at: <https://nbeac.org.pk/images/annualreport/NBEAC%207DDC%20Report%202020.pdf>



Key Takeaways from the Conference

The main themes of the conference were quality and inclusivity. A diversity of views was on offer at the Conference, not surprising given the national representation of participants and panelists. From this diversity, some points of consensus emerged. These are noted below as suggestions for business school leaders (including owners, administrators and faculty).

Business schools should embrace quality as a high priority objective

The Chairman of NBEAC, Dr. Farrukh Iqbal noted that only 22 business schools had achieved quality accreditation so far. The Chief Guest noted a drift towards “mass production of business administration degrees of low quality.” To counter this drift, it was important for more schools to commit to higher quality goals.

Business schools should embrace inclusivity as a high priority objective

The Chief Guest suggested that business schools develop programs of awareness-raising in rural and remote areas, remedial education for those from non-elite secondary schools and financial assistance for those without adequate means.

Business schools should use digital technology to achieve higher quality and inclusivity

The spread of digital technology offered a way to achieve both higher quality and more inclusivity. Excellent teaching resources (lectures, articles, video clips, quizzes and exercises, etc.) from across the globe were now available to anyone with digital access. The quality of education was not limited by the quality of faculty present in a given business school but could be improved simply by incorporating globally-available teaching resources into the learning system. At the same time, by developing online

programs, business schools could reach many more aspiring learners than they are doing at present, including those in remote areas and with limited means.

Business schools should be more open to change and collaboration

The rapidity of change in the world of business, in part brought about by the digital revolution, requires Pakistani business schools to become more flexible and nimble. They should not remain wedded to old curricula or conventional pedagogy. They should collaborate with the business sector in order to remain relevant in fast changing times. They should collaborate with each other to learn better ways of teaching students, doing research, building links with industry and benefiting from alumni networks.

Business schools should connect more to national development challenges

While many academic disciplines are narrow and technical in scope, business education is broad and can play an important role in national development. In particular, it could help in such areas as promoting entrepreneurship, grooming more women for leadership roles, and generating knowledge in critical areas like export development. These and other issues of importance to national development should be more prominently featured in business school curricula.

Inaugural Session



Dr. Farrukh Iqbal (Chairman, NBEAC)

Dr. Farrukh Iqbal noted that the themes of the conference, quality and inclusivity, had been chosen with an eye to highlighting the importance of these issues for business education in Pakistan. Quality was central to NBEAC's mission as it had been set up to be a quality accreditation body. Inclusivity was also an important element of NBEAC's guiding philosophy. The fact that the DDC continued to attract participants from all over the country and from a variety of business schools (public and private, rural and urban, small and large) testified to the efforts made by NBEAC to be inclusive.

Dr. Iqbal apprised the gathering that NBEAC's experience to date with assessing the quality of Pakistani business schools had been somewhat disappointing. Only 22 of about 140 registered institutions had received accreditation so far. Some institutions had received accreditation several years ago but had subsequently failed to qualify for reaccreditation. Many business schools had never even applied for accreditation. What lay behind this disappointing outcome?

One possibility was that NBEAC's accreditation standards were set too high. He noted, however, that the relevant standards were periodically modified in light of both domestic and international benchmarks and seemed to be reasonable. Another possibility was that many Pakistani business schools did not strive hard enough to improve their standards since the lack of accreditation did not affect their license to operate. A third possibility was that the potential for higher quality existed among Pakistani business schools but NBEAC needed to mount a stronger mentoring and training effort to get them over the line.

Dr. Naukhez Sarwar (Vice Chairman, NBEAC)

Dr. Sarwar noted that DDC7 had been designed to learn from the diversity of experience among Pakistani business schools. Accordingly, in addition to a general session on common issues of quality and inclusivity, separate sessions had been arranged to learn from public and private business schools,

on the one hand, as well as from rural and urban business schools, on the other. He said that different schools had developed different approaches to common challenges in light of their own constraints and strengths. As these schools shared information about their practices and approaches, both formally at panel sessions and informally in breakout gatherings, all participants would benefit.

Ahtesham Ali Raja (PD, NBEAC)

Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja took the opportunity to bid a special welcome to Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad, former chairman of HEC. He also recalled the contributions of the late Dr. Hassan Murad in establishing NBEAC and guiding it to its present state of achievement. With regard to the present conference, he expressed his gratitude to all the university and corporate sponsors who had made contributions.

Dr. Abdul Hafeez Shaikh (Advisor to PM and Chief Guest)

Dr. Abdul Hafeez Shaikh (Advisor to the Prime Minister for Finance & Revenue) thanked the organizers for having invited him to what promised to be an important and interesting gathering. He thought the timing was appropriate as Pakistan was emerging from an economic emergency. He thought the themes of the conference were appropriate as it was important for business schools to enhance quality and inclusivity. In a wide-ranging talk, he mentioned two areas in which he thought business education in Pakistan had failed. First, it had become characterized by the mass production of business administration degrees of low quality. Second, it had failed to imbue the corporate sector with lessons and leaders to achieve success in raising exports and attracting foreign investment.

He said that the present government was committed to expanding exports and had offered a range of incentives towards this goal. Business school leaders should step up and play a role in this effort. They should think about capitalizing on opportunities from China. They should think about partnering with local and international think tanks to analyze and understand the impediments to Pakistani exports. They should integrate digital technology and the ongoing artificial intelligence revolution in their curricula so as to prepare students to take advantage of these developments when they become business owners and managers. Otherwise, it would be like sitting by a river but never benefitting from its potential because of not knowing how to swim!

He also thought that the business education system needed to do much better on inclusivity. He wondered if business schools were reaching out to lower income and remotely situated students who may have potential to participate in higher management education but are denied the opportunity to do so. He wondered if those from a non-English-medium background were being properly integrated. He suggested that business school leaders think about such issues and develop mechanisms for greater inclusivity. These would most likely require programs of awareness raising in rural and remote areas, remedial education for those from non-elite secondary schools and financial assistance for those without adequate means. He noted that this was also an area of priority for the present government that was setting up a fund of 100 billion rupees under its 'Kamyab Jawan' program to offer scholarships for education and seed money for start-up enterprises. The latter was also being done through the National Incubation Program. He invited business school leaders to join the government in this effort to expand opportunity for all in Pakistan.



Dr. Shaikh concluded with a hope and a suggestion.

His hope was that the DDC would generate practical ideas for improving quality and inclusivity in business education with a view to making a contribution to the national economy. His suggestion was that the conference adopt a format which gives maximum scope for people to talk to each other and interact rather than listen passively to speeches from the podium. He said that if practical ideas were indeed generated, he would be happy to engage in another session with selected business education leaders on how the government might help in facilitating their implementation.

Conference Sessions

Engaging stakeholders to achieve inclusivity and quality in business education

Dr. Ishrat Husain, Dr. Farrukh Iqbal, Dr. Zafar Ali Khan and Dr. Muhammad Ahmed were the panelists at this session moderated by Dr. Syed Zahoor Hassan. In his panel remarks, Dr. Ishrat Husain emphasized that quality was an elusive concept, comprising multiple dimensions that were hard to measure. In the end, many fall back on subjective judgments about quality. Among practical ways to assess quality were employer feedback surveys. These provided relevant judgements on the employability of the graduates of particular business schools. Sometimes, the quality of research being done in business schools could also be assessed through peer reviews and citation studies. However, both these measures ignored an important aspect which was whether or not business schools were paying attention to socioeconomic development issues in the country.

Participants asked about: (a) the proper role of the government in addressing education quality and relevance and (b) the proper use of business graduates in the Pakistani corporate sector. With regard to (a), Dr. Ishrat Husain said that the audience appeared to have more faith in government than he did. Government has never been a leader in knowing what would happen in the future. It is usually the private sector that responds first to changing technology and circumstances with the government reacting later. He went on to say that his experience had convinced him that it was not the level of government funding for various education initiatives that mattered but the quality of governance. Government had a habit of simply opening new institutes and centers without ensuring that high quality professionals would run them. Today we have 200 public universities. Very few are of good quality and most have become employment centers for non-academic staff. With regard to (b), Dr. Husain noted that while multinational companies and banks operating in Pakistan had been hiring graduates from the best local business schools, the same was not true of the local private sector. A “seth” culture continued to persist there which was not conducive to decentralizing responsibilities and authorities. The local business sector still had a long road to travel in professionalizing management.

Quality Enhancement Initiatives: Challenges and Solutions across Public and Private Sector Business Schools.

This session was moderated by Dr. Sadia Nadeem and speakers included Dr. Rehana Kausar, Dr. Niaz Bhutto, Mr. Khusro Pervez, Dr. Abdul Rehman and Dr. Huma Ayub. Panelists highlighted the following aspects of NBEAC’s role in quality enhancement: (a) the establishment of internationally-benchmarked standards for quality assessment; (b) the provision of mentorship and assessment services through seasoned academics; and (c) the provision of useful information through seminars and training sessions. Several continuing challenges were also mentioned. Dr. Rehana Kausar noted that the lack of good faculty in many public universities affected their ability to improve quality. Dr. Niaz Bhutto wondered if NBEAC could play a role in facilitating collaboration among business schools in student and faculty exchange. Dr. Abdul Rehman thought that many public sector universities would not apply for accreditation unless it was made mandatory.

Some panelists emphasized differences in the opportunities and constraints faced by public and private universities but there was no consensus. Some thought that public sector universities faced financial constraints which affected faculty and infrastructure development. Others, such as Mr. Khusro Pervez, noted that this was true of private universities as well. Many private universities did not have funds to send faculty for training and did not even have access to HEC funds for this purpose. Dr. Sadia Nadeem observed that her analysis of accreditation success and failure had found no difference between public and private schools or rural and urban schools. The key determinants appeared to be motivation among senior managers to engage in the process of quality improvement and in this regard both public and private business schools featured some very successful cases.

Quality Enhancement Initiatives: Challenges and Solutions across Rural and Urban Sector Business Schools.

This session was moderated by Dr. Asfia Obaid and speakers were Dr. Tariq Ahmed, Dr. Mushtaq A. Sajid, Dr. Shahid Nawaz, Dr. Usman Ghani and Dr. Aneel Salman. Panelists focused on the challenges faced by their own business schools with regard to accreditation. Dr. Mushtaq Sajid noted that his university had faced a severe challenge in attracting good faculty in the 1980s but that this was resolved over time through setting up funds for faculty development, including support for the acquisition of local and foreign PhDs. Dr. Usman Ghani noted a similar challenge and response for his university. Dr. Tariq Ahmed noted that attracting good faculty to rural campuses remained a big challenge. It was difficult to maintain a decent student faculty ratio over time.

Among other challenges, Dr. Shahid Nawaz reported that NBEAC's nine accreditation standards were new to his university and difficult for faculty and senior administrators to understand and implement. Dr. Aneel Salman said that documentation was not adequately emphasized at his university which found the request for documentation difficult to manage. Dr. Mushtaq Sajid observed that one of his biggest challenges was arranging a link between his university and industry since there was not that much local industry to speak of. Several panelists noted that there was no tradition of a formal strategic planning process in their universities. This was begun in order to meet the relevant NBEAC standard.

Contemporary Curriculum Designs and Learning Pedagogies

The session was moderated by Dr. Zaki Rashidi and speakers were Dr. Irfan Hyder, Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema, Dr. Zeeshan Ahmed, Dr. Aamir Khan and Dr. Nadia Tahir. The theme of flexibility and openness to change was prominent in the panel discussion related to curricula. Dr. Irfan Hyder noted that it was not necessarily a good idea to design local curricula strictly against international benchmarks. Dr. Zeeshan Ahmed noted that every society has unique needs with respect to professional management and entrepreneurship. These must be reflected in business school curricula. Dr. Aamir Khan thought it important to identify the customer when designing the curriculum. Who are the most important customers of business schools? Parents, students or potential employers? Dr. Cheema thought it important to teach students about small enterprises and family businesses since these were the dominant models prevailing in Pakistan. Dr. Nadia Tahir recommended that business schools also consider national priorities in curricula and ensure that they have programs in at least one area that connects with the Sustainable Development Goals.

The Future of Business Education

The session was moderated by Dr. Naveda Kitchlew and speakers were Dr. Idrees Khawaja, Dr. Jawad Syed, Mr. Syed Najmul Hussain, Mr. Sajjeed Aslam and Dr. Nagina Gul. Two themes received the most attention from panelists: (a) the relevance of the current model of business education in Pakistan; and (b) ethics. Regarding the first, Dr. Idrees Khawaja noted that the content of business education in Pakistan was more attuned to the needs and practices of multinational companies rather than the small and medium enterprises that prevail in the country. Dr. Nagina Gul emphasized the need for a better linkage between academic and industry. Mr. Najmul Hussain thought this could be done by inviting industry experts for guest lectures in relevant classes. This practice would also give students better knowledge of Pakistani business issues and practices. Dr. Jawad Syed recommended that business school faculty come out of their classrooms and visit industry to learn from practitioners. Practitioners are far better equipped to solve business problems. He also said that business schools were producing too many MBA generalists whereas the need of the hour was deeper specialization. Dr. Khawaja noted that this could be a tall ask since this may require schools to hire more faculty across a range of specializations. He also thought that a preoccupation with formal quantitative methods among faculty was making their work irrelevant.

Regarding ethics, Mr. Sajjeed Aslam said that this must be an integral part of the business education curriculum. As they start their careers, students have to navigate in a challenging environment where people from top to bottom expect some special payment for their services. Mr. Najmul Hussain echoed a similar sentiment noting that the curriculum for chartered accountants is now expressed as ABCDE for Accounting, Business Economics, Cost Accounting, Data Analysis and Ethics. Dr. Jawad Syed said that ethics should be taught through the use of local role models.

The Impact of Digital Transformation at Workplaces

This session was moderated by Mr. Irfan Wahab Khan and speakers were Mr. Ali Sarfaraz, Dr. Shaukat Brah and Dr. Laeeq-ur-Rehman. Mr. Irfan Wahab set the tone for the session by noting more than five billion persons across the globe now had cell phones while three billion were active on social media every day. There were fifteen billion connections between sensors and devices. This meant that a very large number of people were now connected and had potential access to information. Business schools should make use of this interconnection in what and how they teach. Mr. Ali Sarfaraz continued in the same vein, noting that one could have access to bank accounts and financial services from virtually any location. Financial inclusion trends in Pakistan were also moving in the right direction though penetration was still below that in neighboring countries. Dr. Laeeq agreed with the general point that business schools should make greater use of the digital technology now available. He said data is the new oil when it comes to industry development. Dr. Shaukat Brah observed that Pakistani business schools were not moving as fast into the realm of digital technology as Pakistani companies. He thought it was high time for our universities in general to come forward and produce thinkers, leaders and managers with the right skillsets for the modern age. Mr. Irfan Wahab noted in conclusion that many companies that do not engage with digital transformation will fail. Companies that reinvent themselves periodically to stay abreast of technology have a better chance of survival.



C. ACCREDITATION

Eligibility Screening Committee (ESC) Meetings

The Eighth ESC meeting was held on November 28, 2019 to consider 8 cases. The outcomes were as follows:

- Three business schools met the relevant criteria for accreditation assessment visits.
- One case was given a conditional go-ahead subject to the provision of additional documents.
- Four applications were deferred till the business academic unit meets the basic eligibility & screening policy.

The Ninth ESC meeting was held on March 11, 2020 to consider 7 cases. The outcomes were as follows:

- Five business schools met the relevant criteria for accreditation assessment visits.
- Two applications were deferred.

Accreditation Award Review Committee (AAC) Meetings

The 6th AAC meeting was held on July 19, 2019 to consider 5 cases. The following decisions were made:

- Accreditation Awarded = 00
- Deferred = 05

The 7th AAC meeting was held on January 09, 2020 to consider 3 cases. The following decisions were made:

- Accreditation Awarded = 02
- Deferred = 01

The 8th AAC meeting was held on June 03, 2020 to consider 3 cases. The following decisions were made:

- Accreditation Awarded = 02
- Deferred = 01

Peer Review Visits

Six peer review visits were completed during the year. In each case, a peer review team (PRT) visited the applicant school and carried out the following standard activities: (a) detailed discussions with senior managers on vision, mission and strategic planning and financial management; (b) meetings with faculty on teaching, research and related activities; (c) meetings with students on quality of teaching, extra-curricular activities and career development guidance; (d) selected class visits to observe pedagogical style and content; (e) visits to library and laboratory facilities as well as to academic support offices such as the admissions and examinations units and (f) interactions with alumni affairs staff and alumni.

Summary information about each visit is presented in the table below.

Business School/University	Dates of visit	Peer review team	Visit Type
1. Institute of Business Administration, Karachi	October 03-05, 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Jawad Syed • Dr. Naukhez Sarwar • Dr. Sadia Nadeem • Dr. Idrees Khawaja • Dr. Arshad Khan • Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja. 	Re - accreditation visit

2. NUST Business School, Islamabad	December 04-06, 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Zaki Rashidi • Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema • Dr. Iftikhar-ul-Amin • Dr. Safdar Husain Tahir • Mr. Bilal Nawaz • Ms. Sania Tufail 	Second Re - accreditation visit
3. Riphah International University, Islamabad	December 09-11, 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr Hamid Hassan • Dr. Izhar Hussain • Dr. Faryal Salman • Mr. Mohsin Nishat • Ms. Sania Tufail. 	Second Re - accreditation visit
4. Institute of Business Management (IoBM), Karachi	January 29-31, 2020	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Kumail Abbas Rizvi • Dr. Imran Wazir • Dr. Umar Farooq • Ms. Musarrat Karamat • Mr. Faisal Jalal • Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja 	Second Re- accreditation Visit
5. Lahore School of Economics (LSE)	February 24-26, 2020	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Asfia Obaid • Dr. Niaz Bhutto • Mr. Adil Amin Kazi • Dr. Amber Gul • Mr. Usman Tahir • Ms. Sania Tufail. 	Re- accreditation Visit
6. Abasyn University Peshawar	March 02-04, 2020	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Abdul Raziq • Dr. Nadeem Ahmad Khan • Dr. Imran Riaz • Mr. Mohsin Wadud • Dr. Amir Rashid • Mr. Usman Ali Jadoon 	Accreditation Visit

Peer Reviewer Discussion Forum 2020

A Peer Reviewer Discussion Forum was held (virtually) on April 20, 2020. It attracted 35 participants and was chaired by Dr. Farrukh Iqbal.

Dr. Sadia Nadeem initiated the session by presenting a summary of key changes to the standards of accreditation as reflected in a revised Rubric 3.0. She noted that each of the 9 standards domains had been reviewed and each of the 65 sub-categories had been revisited. Changes were introduced as necessary to clarify language and remove ambiguity, add quantitative guidance where useful, and incorporate the lessons of experience gained from the application of previous rubrics. The self-assessment report had also been revised so as to align it more closely with the rubric.

Dr. Farrukh Iqbal discussed the idea of conducting virtual accreditations in view of the prevailing pandemic. Participants discussed the pros and cons of a virtual accreditation process in the Pakistani context. Most thought that NBEAC should proceed cautiously in this regard.

Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema presented the revised mentorship program. He focused on SWOT analysis and NBEAC's strategic plan 2020-24 along with guidelines for mentorship programs. Participants highlighted the importance of tailoring mentorship engagements to the requirements of the client institutions as far as possible.

D. TRAINING

Online Training “Effective Distance Learning in Covid19 Lockdown”

Date: 2020-05-04 14:00 - 18:00

Venue: Webinar – Zoom

NBEAC successfully organized an online webinar on “Effective Distance Learning in COVID-19 Lock Down” on 4th May 2020. The webinar session was specially designed to discuss different approaches being used and for selecting the best options based on a university’s own circumstances. As almost all of Pakistan’s universities were only delivering via classroom teaching method which mandates the direct interaction between teachers and students, therefore, delivering online classes had been an issue for most of the institutes due to their lack of experience with distance learning. This resulted in them struggling to transition to an all distance learning and online teaching method during the current pandemic, COVID-19. In almost all universities there were very few systems and processes in place for a comprehensive transition to distance learning. Now it is becoming critical for them to tackle the challenge in a creative yet pragmatic way.

The webinar discussed various aspects such as IT department revamping, multiple IT Tools, Student interaction and assessments etc. Some of the IT tools that were discussed in detail and recommended were that of Zoom, Microsoft Team, Facebook live, Offline Recording and professional publishing using tools like VEGAS Pro.

Some of the major learning outcomes of the webinar were exploring different teaching methods for distance learning with their benefits and shortcomings, these includes Online, Offline and Hybrid ; To learn methods for all three domains of learning in online teaching: Cognitive, affective and psychomotor; To learn methods to simulate the experience of classroom teaching in distance learning with minimum adaptations and compromises; To learn methods for encouraging students interactions and To learn effective use of learning management systems (LMS) like Moodle, Canvas etc.

The trainer for the webinar was Dr. Shoab Khan (Professor, NUST College of EME). The webinar was attended by 118 participants representing different business schools all over Pakistan having a proper mix of public and private institutes.

Seminar on “Accreditation of Business Schools”

Date: 2019-12-27 09:00 - 16:00

Venue: Iqra National University, Peshawar

NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) successfully organized a one-day awareness seminar on “Accreditation of Business Schools” at Iqra National University, Peshawar on 27th December 2019.

The Seminar was designed to share an understanding of the spirit of NBEAC accreditation process, its benefits and to provide in-depth guidance to successfully complete the different steps of the NBEAC accreditation process. The seminar was carefully designed to create awareness regarding NBEAC accreditation and to cater to the needs of business schools pursuing accreditation.

Aspects were discussed broadly relating to in-depth understanding of the accreditation process, basic accreditation criteria and registration, discussion on NBEAC standards and guidance on how to prepare and compile the documentation such as registration of applications, SAR, CIR and appendices, Knowledge enhancement regarding the documents required during peer review visit and refining of the capability to arrange and manage an efficient peer review visit. The seminar also focused on Mentorship, understanding of the philosophy of continuous business school during the accreditation/reaccreditation process.

The seminar was attended by 29 participants and was led by our esteemed Consultant: Dr. Muhammad Imran Wazir (Associate Professor, IM Sciences, Peshawar).

Seminar On Accreditation of Business Schools

Date: 2019-12-10 09:00 - 15:00

Venue: Sukkur IBA University

NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) successfully organized a one-day awareness seminar on "Accreditation of Business Schools" at Sukkur Institute of Sukkur IBA University on 10th Dec 2019.

The Seminar was designed to share an understanding of the spirit of NBEAC accreditation process, its benefits and to provide in-depth guidance to successfully complete the different steps of the NBEAC accreditation process. The seminar was carefully designed to create awareness regarding NBEAC accreditation and to cater to the needs of business schools pursuing accreditation.

Aspects were discussed broadly relating to in-depth understanding of the accreditation process, basic accreditation criteria and registration, discussion on NBEAC standards and guidance on how to prepare and compile the documentation such as registration of applications, SAR, CIR and appendices, Knowledge enhancement regarding the documents required during peer review visit and refining of the capability to arrange and manage an efficient peer review visit. The seminar also focused on Mentorship, understanding of the philosophy of continuous improvement review and discussions based on problems faced by the business school during the accreditation/reaccreditation process.

The seminar was led by Dr. Farrukh Iqbal and was attended by 15 participants.

Seminar on Accreditation

Date: 2019-08-19 09:00 - 15:00

Venue: COMSATS University Abbottabad Campus

NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) successfully organized a one-day awareness seminar on "Accreditation of Business Schools" at COMSATS University, Abbottabad Campus on 19th August 2019.

The Seminar was designed to share an understanding of the spirit of NBEAC accreditation process, its benefits and to provide in-depth guidance to successfully complete the different steps of the NBEAC accreditation process. The seminar was carefully designed to create awareness regarding NBEAC accreditation and to cater to the needs of business schools pursuing accreditation.

Aspects were discussed broadly relating to in-depth understanding of the accreditation process, basic accreditation criteria and registration, discussion on NBEAC standards and guidance on how to prepare and compile the documentation such as registration of applications, SAR, CIR and appendices, Knowledge enhancement regarding the documents required during peer review visit and refining of the capability to arrange and manage an efficient peer review visit. The seminar also focused on Mentorship, understanding of the philosophy of continuous business school during the accreditation/reaccreditation process.

The seminar was led by Dr. Syed Zahoor Hassan, Professor, LUMS and was attended by 35 participants.

Workshop on "Impact Assessment of Initiatives and Activities Undertaken by Business Schools"

Date: 2020-02-18 09:00 - 10:30

Venue: Pafsom Arena, Sector E-9, Main Margalla Road, Islamabad

NBEAC organized a workshop on "Impact assessment of Initiatives and Activities undertaken by Business Schools" on 18th February 2020 at PAFSOM Arena, Islamabad.

The workshop aimed to develop an understanding of the principles, procedures and methods used to assess and report the social impact of various initiatives undertaken by business schools. It was designed to create an opportunity for participants to understand the frameworks and tools to consider while measuring the social impact of various activities. Furthermore, it encouraged them to share the best practices that were already adopted by business schools in Pakistan to report their societal contribution.

The consultants for this workshop was Mr. Muhammad Ali Iqbal (General Manager, Ignite) and Mr. Zain Chaudhry (Economist, University of Heidelberg). The workshop was attended by 21 participants representing different business schools all over Pakistan having a proper mix of public and private institutes.

Workshop on "Designing and Aligning PLOs and CLOs"

Date: 2020-02-17 14:00 - 15:30

Venue: PAFSOM Arena, Sector E-9, Main Margalla Road, Islamabad

The workshop on "Designing and Aligning PLO's & CLO's" was organized by NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) in 7th Deans & Directors Conference at PAFSOM Arena, Islamabad on 17th February 2020.

The workshop focused on understanding the need to develop and align Course Learning Outcomes (CLOs) with Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs). Business schools all over the world are emphasizing on the significance of aligning CLOs with PLOs in order to ensure that the learning promised to students is actually taking place. Therefore, there is a need to understand the process of designing PLOs and CLOs, ensuring that they are tightly aligned and developing mechanisms to measure the learning that is taking place. Discussion was carried out on both, the broader philosophy of identifying PLOs and CLOs and the specifics of designing and implementing them.

The consultants for this workshop was Dr. Mujeeb-u-Rehman Bhayo (Assistant Professor and International Accreditation Coordinator, Department of Business Administration, Sukkur IBA). The workshop was attended by 23 participants representing different business schools all over Pakistan having a proper mix of public and private institutes.

Workshop on "Developing Gender and Diversity Leadership in Higher Education"

Date: 2020-01-30 08:00 - 2020-01-31 16:00

Venue: University of Lahore, Lahore

The association between diversity and leadership is synergistic because diversity promotes change as an emerging agent in the structuring of higher education, while leadership promotes practices that identify diversity as a nested context for achieving balance in the social relations between higher education and society. National Business Education Accreditation Council (NBEAC) is therefore

supporting initiatives aimed at developing gender and diversity leadership in higher education. In a pioneer effort, NBEAC-Training and Development Wing successfully organized a workshop on “Developing gender and diversity leadership in higher education” on 30th -31st January 2020 in University of Lahore, Lahore. The objective of this two-day workshop was to develop an understanding of issues related to gender and diversity in higher education institutions and to enable reflections for a way forward.

The intended learning outcomes of the workshop were creation of critical understanding of stereotypes and unconscious bias on the basis of gender and other dimensions of diversity; developing sensitivity and awareness about issues of diversity and identifying differences in higher education; and identifying a possible way forward.

Detailed discussions and exercises were carried out on theoretical understanding of gender equality and diversity at workplaces and the context of the state of gender in Pakistan and higher education. Discussions were also carried out regarding issues of gender and diversity in practice; gender and careers; sexual harassment and Higher Education; diversity and backlash in the classroom; diversity leadership and best practices in HE. The workshop was concluded with participants’ presentation on addressing gender and diversity related issues in HE.

The consultants for this workshop were Dr. Jawad Syed (Professor, Suleman Dawood School of Business, LUMS) and Dr. Faiza Ali (Associate Professor, Suleman Dawood School of Business, LUMS). The workshop was attended by 25 participants representing different business schools from all over Pakistan having a proper mix of public and private institutes.

Workshop on "Developing and Teaching Courses"

Date: 2019-11-19 09:00 - 2019-11-20 17:00

Venue: IQRA University, Islamabad

NBEAC organized a workshop on “Developing and Teaching Courses: OB and HRM at Undergraduate Level” on 19th-20th November 2019 in Iqra University, Islamabad. The two-day workshop was designed to cover all the important aspects of developing and teaching organizational behavior (OB) and human resource management (HRM) courses at undergraduate level.

Detailed discussions and exercises were carried out regarding the issues and challenges faced by the faculty members. The main learning outcomes of the workshop were based on traditional pedagogies and their advantages and disadvantages in teaching, learning and assessment of OB and HRM courses; evaluation of the learning orientation of the Millennials and the appropriate methods to engage them in the classroom; designing or refining OB and HRM courses with locally relevant, interesting, skill-based and learning-orientated content; formulating and matching course learning outcomes with program learning outcomes; and lastly developing and applying effective pedagogies to teach these courses and successfully engaging the students to enhance their learning.

Day 1 of the workshop consisted of four main sessions in which detailed discussions were carried out regarding the workshop overview and introduction, content and topics to cover in OB and HRM, developing and matching PLOS/CLOS, indigenous perspective on OB and HRM and exercises on matching PLOS and CLOS and developing course content for OB and HRM.

Day 2 of the workshop consisted of four main sessions in which detailed discussions were carried out on traditional teaching pedagogies, learning styles of the Pakistani millennials, new teaching pedagogies and experiential learning; marks distribution and evaluation and exercise on updating the course outlines.

The consultants for this workshop were Dr. Sadia Nadeem (Dean, FAST School of Management, FAST-NU, and Islamabad) and Dr. Muhammad Abbas (Associate Professor, FAST School of Management,

FAST-NU, and Islamabad). The workshop was attended by 15 participants representing different business schools all over Pakistan having a proper mix of public and private institutes.

Workshop on "Teaching through Cases"

Date: 2019-09-19 09:00 - 17:00

Venue: Islamabad, Karachi. Lahore

NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) successfully organized a regional workshop on "Teaching through Cases" on 19th September 2019 covering three major cities namely Lahore, Islamabad and Karachi. TDW collaborated with KSBL-Karachi, LSE-Lahore and Bahria University, Islamabad for the said program where the institutes offered their services to host the program. The regional program was launched as to facilitate business schools to minimize the cost incurred as it aided in cutting down additional travelling and accommodation costs of the nominated participants.

These workshops were aimed at encouraging business faculty from Pakistani business schools to improve their case teaching skills. The workshop also provides a platform for experienced faculty members to discuss on a specialized platform their learnings, and the issues they faced in applying the case method from their previous experiences while teaching cases in Pakistan. The workshop was not a one-off intervention but part of a long-term effort by NBEAC to improve business teaching in Pakistan.

The consultants also shared the best practices and an array of acknowledged and provided solutions, concepts and techniques to apply cases on different topic(s) that may work within a particular set of circumstances. Discussions were also carried out regarding the better case teaching techniques. The workshop was attended by more than 60 participants. The workshop was conducted over one day by three experienced case method trainers- Dr. M. Athar Siddiqui (Associate Dean, KSBL), Dr. Aamir Khan (Associate Professor, Lahore School of Economics) and Dr. Farrah Arif (Executive in Residence, LUMS).

Workshop on "Faculty Development at Business Schools"

Date: 2019-07-04 09:00 - 2019-07-05 17:00

Venue: Hotel Elites Nathia Gali | City: Nathiagali, Pakistan

The workshop on "Faculty Development at Business Schools" was organized by NBEAC Training & Development Wing (TDW) at Elites Hotel, Nathiagali on 4th- 5th of July 2019. The workshop highlighted the pivotal role of faculty along with suggestions on the three core responsibilities of a faculty member; teaching, research and service. The program offered guidelines for planning and development of faculty members and concludes with some thoughts on evaluation of the impact aimed to discuss the best practices of governance across the globe to enhance quality of faculty and business education for an efficient coordination of faculty policies and faculty management.

Faculty development has become a priority for all business schools as a way to improve the quality of academic programs and to respond to emerging faculty, student, program, and industry needs. The workshop was intended to deliver among its participants the gist of the rich experience of trainers having vast experience of working with the faculty of accredited Business Schools nationally and internationally.

The workshop content was developed in such a way that it made participants aware about their responsibilities to deal with the faculty of business schools of different challenges involved in this highly complex and sensitive domain. Detailed discussions were held regarding the understanding the roles and expectations of faculty members, student development, Institution, program and course development, external linkages, creation and dissemination of knowledge and collective vision of

business education. Connecting the institutional/organizational culture with your faculty development culture, design and implement a variety of programs to meet diverse needs and student development.

The consultants also shared the best practices and an array of acknowledged and provided solutions that may work within a particular set of circumstances. It was discussed to create effective faculty development programs, it's important to get the faculty members' perspectives on what is actually needed. Without this input and the opportunity for faculty to collaborate and engage in growth and dialogue around common topics of interest, the essence of faculty development is lost. The workshop ended with a keynote "Business School is the faculty and Faculty is the Business School to develop the Business School one has to develop the faculty"

The workshop was attended by 25 participants representing business schools from different sectors, regions and cities of Pakistan. The consultants for this workshop were Dr. Syed Zahoor Hassan, Professor and Former Vice Chancellor LUMS and Dr. Shaukat Ali Brah, Founding and Former Rector KSBL, Former Professor & Dean KSBL, AGU and LUMS.

E. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE (2019-20)

Broad financial outcomes for FY20 are provided in the table below. Due to the Covid19 pandemic, activities were severely curtailed in the fourth quarter of the year, bringing annual income and expenses below projections. NBEAC's income comes mostly from accreditation, training and networking activities. HEC supports selected training activities while commercial and academic sponsors support the main networking activity, namely the annual Deans and Directors Conference. Indeed, the surplus for PKR 3.8 million for the year is due largely to such sponsorships.

Below is a summary for the fiscal year of income and expenses as well as assets and liabilities:

Particulars	2019-20 Amount (PKR)	2018-19 Amount (PKR)
Income	23,859,389	31,610,136
Expenses	20,049,983	25,419,894
Surplus	3,809,406	6,190,242
Non-Current Assets	489,257	554,894
Current Assets	15,638,0032	10,357,250
Reserve Funds	14,250,502	10,441,096
Current Liabilities	126,787	471,048

ANNEXURE I- MEMBERS OF MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

S. No.	Name	Affiliation
1	Dr. Farrukh Iqbal	Former Executive Director IBA Karachi
2	Dr. Naukhez Sarwar	Principal and Dean, NUST
3	Mr. Nisar Siddiqui	Vice Chancellor
4	Syed Mazhar Ali Nasir	SVP, FPCCI
5	Dr. Zahoor Hassan Syed	Professor , LUMS
6	Dr. Abdul Raziq	Professor, IQRA University Karachi
7	Dr. Faheem Ghazanfar	Registrar, University of Kotli, AJKU
8	Dr. Sadia Nadeem	Dean FAST School of Management , National University of Computer and Emerging Sciences, Islamabad
9	Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema	Dean, Faculty of Management and Social Sciences, Bahria University
10	Dr. Muhammad Mohsin Khan	Director, Institute of Management Sciences, Peshawar
11	Dr. Nadia Tahir	Managing Director, QAA, Higher Education Commission, Islamabad
12	Dr. Syed Azhar Hussain Shah	Executive VP, Group Head, HRM, National Bank of Pakistan
13	Mr. Bilal Kazmi	Chief Marketing Officer, Telenor, Pakistan
14	Mr. Zaris Ul Maani	Additional Secretary, Higher Education Department, KPK
15	Mr. Manzoor Niyazi	Deputy Secretary, Higher Education Department, Balochistan
16	Additional Secretary, Higher Education Department, Punjab	Additional Secretary, Higher Education Department, Punjab
17	Mr. Aleem Lashari	Additional Secretary (Planning, Development and Finance), Education & Literacy Department, Sindh

ANNEXURE II- COMMITTEES

NBEAC Committee	Members
Finance Planning Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Mohsin Khan (Convener) • Mr. Mohammad Ashraf • Prof. Aman Ullah Khan • Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja • Mr Asad Khan • Dr Zahoor Hassan Syed
Consultative Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Naukhez Sarwar • Dr. Sadia Nadeem • Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema
Technical Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Sadia Nadeem, • Dr. Asfia Obaid • Mr. Adil Amin Kazi
Eligibility Screening Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Naukhez Sarwar • Dr. Zahoor Hassan Syed • Prof. Dr. Syed Irfan Hyder • Dr. Naveda Kitchlew • Dr. Christophe Terrasse • Dr. Sadia Nadeem • Dr. Imran Wazir • Dr. Tariq Ahmed • Mr. Mohsin Nishat
Rubric Review Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Farrukh Iqbal • Dr. Shaukat Brah • Dr. Sadia Nadeem • Dr. Abdul Rehman • Dr. Asfia Obaid
Committee for Nominating Council Members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Farrukh Iqbal • Dr. Naukhez Sarwer • Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema • Dr. Jawad Syed
Strategic Planning and Development Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Farrukh Iqbal • Dr. Jawad Syed • Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema • Dr. Naukhez Sarwar
Accreditation Award Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Zaki Rashidi • Dr. Shaukat Brah • Dr. Rasheed Kausar • Dr. Muhammad Mohsin Khan • Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema • Dr. Asfia Obaid • Mr. Mohsin Nishat • Dr. Kumail Abbas Rizvi

ANNEXURE III- NBEAC SECRETARIAT STAFF

Sr. No.	Name	Designation
1.	Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja	Program Director
2.	Ms. Sania Tufail	Senior Program Manager
3.	Ms. Nomeeta Maqsood	Deputy Program Manager
4.	Mr. Asad Khan	Accounts Manager
5.	Mr. Muhammad Usman	Public Relations Manager
6.	Ms. Maryam Akhtar	Assistant Manager Training & Development
7.	Mr. Muhammad Irfan	Assistant Manager Accreditation
8.	Mr. Usman Ali Jadoon	Assistant Manager Accreditation
9.	Muhammad Usman Khan	MTO
10.	Muhammad Tahir	IT Assistant
11.	Muhammad Noman	Office Assistant

ANNEXURE IV- PARTNERSHIPS FOR TRAINING

In 2018, a process of collaboration was initiated with several prominent business schools (see table below) to facilitate training activities. Broadly speaking, the business schools agreed to host some NBEAC-sponsored training events free of charge while NBEAC agreed to offer some training spaces to them free of charge. Beyond this exchange of services, however, lies an agreement for the business schools to become more active partners in NBEAC's training mandate. We hope to expand the list of partners over time.

Name of University	Date of MOU
Institute of Business Management, Karachi	20 th July 2018
Iqra University, Karachi	20 th July 2018
Karachi School of Business & Leadership (KSBL)	19 th July 2018
University of Management & Technology (UMT)	10 th July 2018
Lahore School of Economics (LSE)	3 rd August 2018
Bahria University, Islamabad	7 th September 2018
Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi	22 nd October 2018
Iqra National University, Peshawar	11 th September 2019
Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Sukkur	12 th September 2019
Balochistan University of Information Technology, Engineering and Management Sciences, Quetta	5 th November 2019
Air University, Islamabad	18 th December 2019
Iqra University, Islamabad	31 st December 2019
Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science And Technology (SZABIST), Islamabad	16 th of January 2020
University of Lahore (UOL)	1 st February 2020
Karakoram International University	13 th February 2020
The University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir	18 th February 2020